

Options Table

Appendix B

Options Considered	Benefits	Disadvantages
<p>1. Status quo: maintain Alltwen, Godre'rgraig and Llangiwig Primary Schools, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwig) • Alltwen and Llangiwig Primary schools will remain in their current location and existing buildings, i.e. no change process for staff and pupils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environments not achievable • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwig primaries – circa.£1.9m • Godre'rgraig Primary has no permanent building – additional provision will be needed; suitable site would need to be identified • No revenue efficiencies • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>2. Establish a federation of Alltwen, Godre'rgraig and Llangiwig Primary schools, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwig) • Alltwen and Llangiwig Primary schools will remain in their current location and existing buildings i.e. no change process for staff and pupils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environments not achievable • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwig primaries circa.£1.9m • Godre'rgraig Primary has no permanent building additional provision will be needed; suitable site would need to be identified • No revenue efficiencies • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>3. Close two of the schools and transfer all pupils to the remaining school, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwig) • Alltwen or Llangiwig Primary schools would remain in their current location and existing buildings i.e. no change process for staff and pupils • Potential ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment not achievable • Limited space available at Alltwen and Llangiwig currently for additional pupils and Godre'rgraig is in a temporary building • Insufficient space to increase capacity through extending the buildings at the current schools • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwig primaries circa.£1.9m

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>4. Close one of the three schools and transfer pupils to the remaining two schools, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No build cost (for Alltwen and Llangiwg) • If Godre’rgraig Primary were the school chosen to close then this option would resolve their temporary building issue - this would also mean no build cost for Godre’rgraig • Potential ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environments not realised • Insufficient space at any one site to accommodate two additional school populations, Godre’rgraig is in a temporary building • Backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remain for Alltwen and Llangiwg circa.£1.9m • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high
<p>5. Close Alltwen, Godre’rgraig and Llangiwg Primary schools and build a new replacement primary school on one of the existing school sites, maintain the pool in its current position, do not establish a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One of the schools will remain at their current location i.e. no change process for staff and pupils of that school • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum (partially realised) • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • Ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Confined and restricted sites meaning 21st century school learning environment not fully realised, or new build not possible on site • Significant capital cost – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Additional cost of temporary accommodation to house pupils during the build process • Pupils/staff from two closing schools could feel at a disadvantage • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Pressure for ASD places remains high • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>6. Close Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre’rgraig Primary schools and build a new school in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre’rgraig establish a new ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • WG funding secured • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost £22.7m • Change process for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • Backlog maintenance for existing pool circa.£1.3m removed • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Ongoing revenue savings 	
<p>7. Close Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primary schools and build a new school on another site to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primaries, establish a new ASD provision and maintain the pool in its current location</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Ongoing revenue savings 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No viable site identified within the area • Likely to be significant capital cost (unable to estimate as no viable site identified) • WG funding not secured for a different site • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool circa.£1.3m • Change process for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>8. Maintain status quo for Alltwen and Llangiwig and provide a new build school for Godre'rgraig pupils in Gnoll Road, Godre'rgraig, with a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Less disruption and fear of change to the school communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alltwen and Llangiwig would remain in poor quality buildings with backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues remaining circa.£1.9m • Significant capital cost (estimated between £5.5m and £9m depending on pupil numbers) – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Gnoll Road is an extremely challenging site, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised, or new build not possible on site • Revenue efficiencies not optimised • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool

		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Possible impact on Welsh medium education of new build school in the same location as existing Welsh medium school
<p>9. Refurbishment of Alltwen and Llangiwg Primaries and a new build school for Godre’rgraig pupils in Gnoll Road, Godre’rgraig with a new ASD provision</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum for Godre’rgraig pupils • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues addressed for Alltwen and Llangiwg Primaries • Less disruption and fear of change for the Godre’rgraig community • Less fear of change for the Alltwen and Llangiwg communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Whilst Alltwen and Llangiwg Primaries would have their backlog maintenance and accessibility issues addressed at circa.£1.9m, these costs are only for putting the building back into repair, and don’t allow for improving, upgrading, remodelling or extending the existing buildings to provide facilities (internally and externally) appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum; • The estimate of backlog maintenance and accessibility costs do not reflect a true market value and are likely to be higher than indicated when tendered. No funding has been secured for this type of repair work • Major logistical issues (and additional costs) associated with temporary decant, relocation and transport of Alltwen and Llangiwg pupils whilst refurbishment is being undertaken. • Significant capital cost for new build (estimated between £5.5m and £9m depending on pupil numbers) – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Gnoll Road is an extremely challenging site, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised, or new build not possible on site • Ongoing revenue costs • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education

<p>10. Build 3 new, replacement primary schools on the existing sites of Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre’rgraig Primary schools, maintain the pool in its current position, and establish a new ASD provision on one of the sites</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Less disruption and fear of change to the school communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Current schools on confined and restricted sites, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised or new build not possible on site • Likely to be significant capital cost (unable to estimate due to unknown design to fit restricted sites available) • WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Ongoing revenue costs for 3 schools • Existing Godre’rgraig site is unsafe. Godre’rgraig is in a temporary building, therefore no existing site available • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>11. Build 3 new, replacement primary schools on the existing sites of Alltwen, Llangiwg and at Gnoll Road , Godrergraig for Godre’rgraig Primary school, maintain the pool in its current position, and establish a new ASD provision on one of the sites</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Less disruption and fear of change to the school communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Alltwen and Llangiwg on confined and restricted sites, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised or new build not possible on site • Likely to be significant capital cost (at Alltwen and Llangiwg - unable to estimate due to unknown design to fit restricted sites available) – WG funding not guaranteed • Significant capital cost for new build at Gnoll Road (estimated between £5.5m and £9m depending on pupil numbers) – WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Gnoll Road is an extremely challenging site, increasing capital costs and meaning some of the

		<p>benefits of a new build school would be significantly compromised, or new build not possible on site</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ongoing revenue costs for 3 schools • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>12. Build 2 new replacement schools, 1 for Alltwen and Llangiwg at Parc Ynysderw, and 1 at Gnoll Road , Godrergraig for Godre'rgraig Primary school, maintain the pool in its current position, and establish a new ASD provision on one of the sites</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed circa.£1.9m • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost (estimate £11m for school 1 and £5.5m for school 2 depending on pupil numbers) - WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Ongoing revenue costs for 2 schools –these costs would be significantly higher than the proposal for one new build school, estimates indicate circa. £525k required every year to fund this model • Change process for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • The backlog maintenance remains for the pool • Possible impact on Welsh-medium education
<p>13. Close Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre'rgraig Primary schools and build a new bilingual school in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwg and Godre'rgraig, establish a new ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • WG funding secured • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed • Ongoing revenue savings • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places and provides access opportunities for local pupils • Promotes WESP targets for increasing Welsh-medium education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost £22.7m - WG funding not guaranteed (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Disruption and fear of change for the school communities involved • Additional travel time for some pupils • Likelihood of negative impact on existing Welsh medium schools in the area due to attraction of bilingual education in new build premises • No existing Welsh medium pupil and staff base from which to develop Welsh –medium provision

<p>14. Close Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig Primary schools, and YGG Trebannws, and build a new bilingual school in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 700 pupils (plus 170 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of Alltwen, Llangiwig and Godre'rgraig, establish a new bilingual ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum • Godre'rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Existing Welsh medium pupil and staff base from which to develop Welsh –medium provision • Promotes WESP targets for increasing Welsh-medium education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost, £22.7m+, WG funding not secured (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Disruption and fear of change for the school communities involved • Additional school closure involved • YGG Trebannws has recently benefited from 'Increasing WM Provision' WG grant funding £460K which under this option would be abandoned and potentially subject to WG grant clawback if the school were to close • Additional travel time for some pupils • Possibility of negative impact on YGG Pontardawe due to attraction of bilingual education in new build premises ; however, this option could equally be unpopular with some families at YGG Trebannws, meaning YGG Pontardawe would be a more attractive offer, increasing numbers there through existing WM NPT pupils and preventing new WM growth • Increases the size of an already large school
--	---	--

<p>15. Close YGG Pontardawe, YGG Trebannws and Godre’rgraig primary schools and build a new bilingual school in in Parc Ynysderw to accommodate 630 pupils (plus 140 nursery pupils) from the catchment areas of YGG Trebannws, YGG Pontardawe and Godre’rgraig, establish a new bilingual ASD provision and build a new pool.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 21st century school learning environment appropriate to the demands of the new curriculum for YGG Pontardawe , YGG Trebannws and Godre’rgraig • Godre’rgraig pupils no longer housed in temporary buildings • Existing backlog maintenance and accessibility costs/issues removed for YGG Pontardawe and YGG Trebannws • New pool and some remodelling of existing leisure centre provides improved community opportunities for health and wellbeing • New LSC reduces demand for specialist primary ASD places • Existing Welsh medium pupil and staff base from which to develop Welsh –medium provision • Promotes WESP targets for increasing Welsh-medium education 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Significant capital cost, £22.7m+, WG funding not secured (any new or changed proposal would mean a fresh application to the WG business case approval process) • Disruption and fear of change for the school communities involved • YGG Pontardawe and YGG Trebannws have recently benefited from ‘Increasing WM Provision’ WG grant funding of circa £2.65m which under this option would be abandoned and potentially subject to WG grant clawback if the school were to close • Additional travel time for some pupils • Alltwen and Llangiwig would not benefit from 21st century educational facilities and would remain in existing buildings • Funding not available for improving facilities in EM schools through the ‘Increasing WM Provision’ WG grant funding , therefore backlog maintenance and accessibility costs for Alltwen and Llangiwig would remain.
---	--	--

Additional Information

In relation to options referring to refurbishment of Alltwen and Llangiwig Primary schools it is important to note that Welsh Government have a strict business case process that must be satisfied in order to obtain Sustainable Communities for Learning grant funding , which includes scrutiny of the strategic, economic and financial case of any proposal.

In their ‘Sustainable communities for Learning Business Case Guidance’ document it states –

The Capital expenditure for schools/educational purposes comprises of the following:

The cost of acquiring land and buildings

Cost of new construction

Cost of extensions to existing buildings

The enhancement of land, road or buildings (within the school/college footprint)*

Purchase of computers/computer equipment if they form part of a large scale capital project can be capitalised, including associated cabling and hardware.

**Enhancement is where money is spent on an existing asset which substantially increases its value or lengthens its useful life. It excludes routine repairs and maintenance.*

Funding for the 21st Century Schools and College Programme is targeted to support remodelling and reconstruction:

Remodelling – extensive upgrading of the existing building and redesign of the accommodation (e.g. curriculum-led upgrades, new facilities and full DDA compliance).

Reconstruction – e.g. partial/total demolition and rebuilding to modern standards (i.e. 21st Century Schools' standard).

The guidance also contains detailed information regarding the additional aspects that need to be met to satisfy Welsh Government, including ensuring modern construction standards for acoustics, accessibility, recycled content and carbon reduction, and that the requirements of the biodiversity and resilience of ecosystems duty are discharged, along with achieving British Research Establishment Environmental Assessment Method (BREEAM) standard EXCELLENT. Projects funded through Sustainable Communities for Learning Programme are also expected to optimise the use of infrastructure and resources, to deliver facilities that can be used by communities.

It is the case that both existing schools are compromised in terms of their building suitability for 21st Century teaching and learning, and fall short of many of the internal and external space standards and requirements as set out within Building Bulletin 99 that would ordinarily be expected in a brand new 21st Century school. The difficulties of ensuring that a robust business case can be developed and approved, with the likely significant additional costs of creating 3 21st century schools to the required standards, would be extremely challenging.

Without Welsh Government funding, any alternative proposal that revolved around maintaining all three existing schools and the pool in their current locations would mean that the Council would have to meet 100% of any associated capital costs.

The Council currently spends circa £1.2m each year of its own capital funding to address maintenance needs on schools and there are many competing priorities each and every year. Given the current financial situation it is not realistic to expect a huge influx or redistribution of finances in the foreseeable future.

Total backlog maintenance and accessibility costs for Alltwen and Llangiwg primary schools and the swimming pool amount to circa. £3.1m.

With this in mind if the Council only addressed the notional £3.1m of backlog maintenance costs then that alone would exhaust all of the capital resources currently allocated to cover repairs and backlog maintenance pressures across the whole of the school portfolio for almost three years.

It is important to clarify that the backlog maintenance and accessibility costs derived from the condition reports are estimates for putting the existing buildings back into repair, and do not account for improving, extending, remodelling or upgrading (internally or externally).

Developing a scheme to undertake this type of improvement work would prove to be considerably more than the figures outlined in the condition report. The backlog maintenance and accessibility estimates do not take account of costs associated with design, supervision or any statutory fees nor do they provide for any remodelling works internally or externally to improve the suitability and layouts of the existing premises. The condition report has not considered needs beyond 5-10 years (mainly 1-5 years in accordance with Welsh Government backlog maintenance returns); other works, required after 10 years, may be of a substantial and significant cost that would need to be undertaken during any future refurbishment and fall outside the scope of the current condition survey.

Some of the options explore new build schools made up of combinations of the current schools. For these the base figures are the pupil numbers currently within the schools along with an estimate of the pupils from the catchment or combination of catchments attending elsewhere.

Options have also been considered which suggest alternative sites for a new school. Extensive desktop work has been undertaken on all identified potential sites across the area and all but two have been ruled out for a range of reasons including being too small, at risk of flooding, previous mine workings, contaminated land and land of ecological value. Of the remaining two sites Parc Ynysderw is the preferable site and will also support the development of a health and wellbeing learning campus.

The second feasible site is at Gnoll Road in Godre'rgraig. This has been identified through desktop studies as a very challenging site. This is due to the site being identified as high risk area for coal workings, and partly within a flood zone (lower end).

Contamination of the land is also noted, so the site would require full investigation and standard conditions. The site is also noted to be outside settlement limits and in a prominent position in open countryside which could pose planning approval difficulties.

The location of the site leads to a challenging gradient and bends close down the area of visibility, making the current access road unsafe and unsuitable; work to address this would need to take up significant amounts of land into the site to address TAN 18 requirements. There are also currently no suitable pedestrian footway links to the site.

It could be possible to access the site off the A4067 – this is likely to require formal traffic reduction orders, and significant works to allow safe exit of vehicles from the A4067 onto the site, possibly a new right turn lane or controlled junction. These works are likely to require significant design and cost.

It is clear that if a proposal for this site were to be considered in any more detail, then significant site investigations would need to be undertaken. Based on previous investigations at other sites around the county it is estimated that these could cost circa. £100-150k. No funding has been identified to undertake such investigations.

It should also be noted that should funding be sourced for undertaking this detailed work on a new and potentially unviable site, then this would inevitably increase the time needed before a new build could be progressed, therefore Godre'rgraig Primary staff and pupils would inevitably remain for a longer period of time in temporary accommodation.

Additionally it should be noted that in the case of the Welsh language the impacts of a new build English-medium primary in close proximity to a new build Welsh-medium 3-19 school would have to be carefully considered. Under the current proposal pupils in the Godre'rgraig area do not have to travel to access Welsh-medium provision but they do need to travel to English-medium provision, making Welsh-medium an easier choice. A new build English-medium school however in very close proximity removes the easy choice.